



## **TECHNOLOGY FOR SUSTAINABILITY SUBCOMMITTEE**

**Conference Call Summary  
Wednesday, May 30, 2007  
3:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time**

### **Welcome**

*Dr. John Giesy, University of Saskatchewan, Subcommittee Chair*

Dr. John Giesy, Chair of the Technology for Sustainability Subcommittee, welcomed the Subcommittee members to the conference call. He then asked Ms. Clois Slocum to review the administrative procedures.

### **Administrative Procedures**

*Ms. Clois Slocum, Subcommittee Designated Federal Officer (DFO), U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)/Office of Research and Development (ORD)*

Ms. Slocum took roll and then reviewed the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) procedures that are required for all Board of Scientific Counselors (BOSC) Subcommittee meetings. As the DFO for the Technology for Sustainability Subcommittee, Ms. Slocum serves as the liaison between the Subcommittee, the public, and EPA; is the point of contact for all needs; and ensures that all FACA requirements are met. She explained that the BOSC is a Federal Advisory Committee that provides independent, scientific peer review for EPA's ORD.

Ms. Slocum stated that all meetings and conference calls involving substantive issues, whether in person, by phone, or by e-mail, that include one-half or more of the Subcommittee members must be open to the public and a notice must be placed in the *Federal Register* at least 15 calendar days prior to the call or meeting. The information for this conference call was published in the *Federal Register* on April 4, 2007, and entered into the federal docket management system (<http://www.regulations.gov>; Docket ID EPA-HQ-ORD-2006-1010). The Subcommittee Chair and DFO must be present at all conference calls and meetings.

This call is a follow-up to the face-to-face meeting held in February 2007. The Chair will administer the call according to the preapproved agenda and mediate discussions. The Subcommittee Chair must recognize EPA staff members before they provide comments. Because a notetaker is taking detailed notes of the call, Ms. Slocum asked speakers to identify themselves when making a comment. The summary of this call will be made available to the public after certification by the Subcommittee Chair. The Chair must certify the summary within 90 days of the call. The summary then will be posted on the BOSC Web Site (<http://www.epa.gov/osp/bosc>). She stated that no requests for public comment were submitted prior to the call, but the agenda allows time for public comment at 3:20 p.m. She will call for public comments at that time.

If there are outstanding technical issues following this conference call, another conference call will be scheduled. All comments from Subcommittee members regarding the draft report must be sent to the Chair only and not to the entire Subcommittee. Editorial comments do not have to be discussed in a public call; these may be sent directly to the Chair. To meet FACA requirements, the next conference call may be scheduled any time after June 22, 2007.

### **Subcommittee Discussion**

*Dr. John Giesy, University of Saskatchewan, Subcommittee Chair*

Dr. Giesy explained that he had contacted Dr. James Clark, Chair of the BOSC Executive Committee, and Ms. Lori Kowalski, DFO of the BOSC Executive Committee, and they had approved a new schedule for completion of the draft report. The draft report from the face-to-face meeting will be completed no later than June 4, 2007, and sent to Ms. Slocum to distribute to the Subcommittee members. Dr. Giesy asked the Subcommittee members if they had additional comments or thoughts regarding the draft report, the revised schedule, or the progress.

Dr. Earl Beaver asked if the disparate views on the overall rating for the Program were going to be resolved. Dr. Giesy explained that, per Dr. Clark, another Subcommittee had the same problems with the rating scale as this Subcommittee. The “satisfactory” terminology is not in line with the other ratings and is somewhat pejorative. The BOSC Executive Committee will examine the terminology of the rating and change the definition to “met all or most objectives” and the term to “very good” so that the definition and term are aligned with the other rating terms.

### **Public Comment**

*Ms. Clois Slocum, Subcommittee DFO, EPA/ORD*

Ms. Slocum offered members of the public the opportunity to comment at 3:20 p.m. No comments were offered so the discussion resumed.

### **Subcommittee Discussion (Continued)**

*Dr. John Giesy, University of Saskatchewan, Subcommittee Chair*

Dr. Giesy explained that after the changes to the ratings are complete, he would be comfortable using the category that “meets most or all goals” to rate the overall Science and Technology for Sustainability (STS) Program, and detailed explanations of those goals that were not met and those that exceeded expectations will be included.

Ms. Kowalski clarified that the term “satisfactory” would be changed to “meets expectations” to parallel the other rating terms. The term “satisfactory” is not consistent with the definition. The BOSC Executive Committee discussed this issue and found that the current rating term is insufficient. Several BOSC Subcommittees are drafting and finalizing reports, so the change is expected to be made next week so that all of the reports can use the new rating term. It is important to remember that the Subcommittee’s narrative that describes the basis for why the rating was received is more important than the rating itself. Dr. Giesy expressed concern about those who look at the rating only (i.e., those outside of ORD) and do not consider the accompanying narrative.

Dr. Beaver commented that he attended the U.S. EPA Environmental Technology Verification (ETV) and Small Business Innovation Research (SBIR) Programs Regional Workshop in Dallas, Texas, and was able to discuss in depth many of the projects that were presented at the face-to-face meeting. He does not think that the poster session at the face-to-face meeting captured the full richness of the programs presented. He asked how he should proceed in capturing his thoughts and sharing them with the rest of the Subcommittee. Dr. Giesy asked Dr. Beaver to write his thoughts down and forward them to him. If

Dr. Giesy believes that the rest of the Subcommittee should be privy to the new information, he will forward the document to the Subcommittee members. Dr. Beaver responded that the instructions, verbiage, and ethics training required by FACA were somewhat intimidating, and he wanted to “go by the letter of the law.” Dr. Giesy explained that anything Dr. Beaver discovered to which the other Subcommittee members are not privy could be formally clarified by STS Program scientists and leadership. Dr. Beaver agreed to write his thoughts and send them to Ms. Slocum to forward to Dr. Giesy. Ms. Slocum added that these comments could be incorporated into the scope. Dr. Giesy asked Dr. Beaver to send his comments as soon as possible, and Dr. Beaver agreed to send them within 24 hours of the call.

Dr. Giesy reminded Subcommittee members that they could call him to discuss any issues. Ms. Kowalski cautioned that all Subcommittee members need to have the same access to all information so that a consensus can be reached. Dr. Giesy agreed and promised to forward any information he received to the Subcommittee as a whole.

Dr. Giesy asked Dr. Beaver if it would be possible to receive copies of the posters and/or presentations that he had viewed at the meeting. Dr. Cynthia Nolt-Helms stated that Ms. April Richards coordinated the meeting and should have all of the meeting materials. Ms. Teresa Harden confirmed that all meeting materials are available. Dr. Giesy asked Ms. Slocum to obtain the materials and distribute them within FACA limits.

Dr. Giesy stated that the next conference call would take place after June 22, 2007. Dr. Peter Blaze Corcoran asked if the exact date and time had been determined. Dr. Giesy replied that the date and time needed to be determined, and Ms. Slocum would contact Subcommittee members regarding their availability. Ms. Kowalski added that the June 22 date was a presumption that the call would be scheduled during this conference call. If it is not, then the date would need to be delayed by approximately 1 week.

Ms. Slocum stated that she would obtain a consensus of when to schedule the next call from the Subcommittee members. Dr. Beaver commented that the 11th Annual Green Chemistry and Engineering Conference would be held the week of June 25, so this may not be a good week to schedule the call.

Dr. Giesy thanked the Subcommittee members for their time and adjourned the call at 3:45 p.m.

### **Action Items**

- ✍ Dr. Giesy will complete the draft report and send it to Ms. Slocum no later than June 4, 2007.
- ✍ Dr. Beaver will send his comments regarding the U.S. EPA ETV and SBIR Programs Regional Workshop within 24 hours of the conference call.
- ✍ Ms. Harden and Ms. Slocum will work together to provide Subcommittee members the posters and PowerPoint presentations presented at the U.S. EPA ETV and SBIR Programs Regional Workshop.
- ✍ Ms. Slocum and Dr. Giesy will discuss possible dates and times for the next conference call and send the selection to the Subcommittee members via e-mail to determine their availability.

## PARTICIPANTS LIST

### Subcommittee Members

#### **John P. Giesy, Ph.D., Chair**

Professor and Canada Research Chair in  
Environmental Toxicology  
Department of Veterinary Biomedical Sciences  
University of Saskatchewan  
44 Campus Drive  
Saskatoon, SK S7N 5B3  
Canada  
Phone: 306-966-7441  
E-mail: jgiesy@aol.com

#### **Martin Abraham, Ph.D.**

Professor of Chemical Engineering  
Department of Chemical and Environmental  
Engineering  
Dean of the College of Graduate Studies  
University of Toledo  
Toledo, OH 43606  
Phone: 419-530-8092  
E-mail: martin.abraham@utoledo.edu

#### **Earl R. Beaver, Ph.D., FAICHe**

Chair Emeritus  
Institute for Sustainability  
14500 White Birch Valley Lane  
Chesterfield, MO 63017-2418  
Telephone: 636-536-1256  
E-mail: erbeav@aol.com

#### **Concepción Jiménez-González, Ph.D.**

GlaxoSmithKline  
2245 Plum Frost Drive  
Raleigh, NC 27603  
Phone: 919-315-2139  
E-mail: conchita.j.gonzalez@gsk.com

#### **Wayne Landis, Ph.D.**

Chair of the Department of Environmental  
Sciences  
Director of the Institute of Environmental  
Toxicology  
Huxley College of the Environment  
Western Washington University  
Bellingham, WA 98225-9180  
Phone: 360-650-6136  
E-mail: wayne.landis@wwu.edu

### Consultant to the Subcommittee

#### **Peter Blaze Corcoran, Ph.D.**

Professor of Environmental Studies and  
Environmental Education  
Director of the Center for Environmental and  
Sustainability Education  
College of Arts and Sciences  
Florida Gulf Coast University  
10501 FGCU Boulevard South  
Fort Myers, FL 33965-6565  
Phone: 239-590-7166  
E-mail: pcorcora@fgcu.edu

### Designated Federal Officer

#### **Clois Slocum**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Risk Management Research  
Laboratory (235)  
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
Phone: 513-569-7281  
E-mail: slocum.clois@epa.gov

### EPA Participants

#### **Heriberto Cabezas, Ph.D.**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Risk Management Research  
Laboratory (498)  
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
Phone: 513-569-7350  
E-mail: cabezas.heriberto@epa.gov

#### **Alva Daniels**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Risk Management Research  
Laboratory (235)  
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
Phone: 513-569-7693  
E-mail: daniels.alva@epa.gov

**Gordon Evans, Ph.D.**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Risk Management Research  
Laboratory (497)  
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
Phone: 513-569-7684  
E-mail: [evans.gordon@epa.gov](mailto:evans.gordon@epa.gov)

**Michael Gonzalez, Ph.D.**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Risk Management Research  
Laboratory (466)  
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
Phone: 513-569-7998  
E-mail: [gonzalez.michael@epa.gov](mailto:gonzalez.michael@epa.gov)

**Sally Gutierrez**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Risk Management Research  
Laboratory (235)  
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
Phone: 513-569-7683  
E-mail: [gutierrez.sally@epa.gov](mailto:gutierrez.sally@epa.gov)

**Teresa Harten**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Risk Management Research  
Laboratory (208A)  
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
Phone: 513-569-7565  
E-mail: [harten.teresa@epa.gov](mailto:harten.teresa@epa.gov)

**Alan Hecht**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
Ariel Rios Building (8101R)  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460  
Phone: 202-564-4772  
E-mail: [hecht.alan@epa.gov](mailto:hecht.alan@epa.gov)

**Cynthia Nolt-Helms, Ph.D.**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Center for Environmental Research  
Ariel Rios Building (8722F)  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460  
Phone: 202-343-9693  
E-mail: [nolt-helms.cynthia@epa.gov](mailto:nolt-helms.cynthia@epa.gov)

**Lorelei Kowalski**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
Office of Science Policy  
Ariel Rios Building (8104R)  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460  
Phone: 202-564-3408  
E-mail: [kowalski.lorelei@epa.gov](mailto:kowalski.lorelei@epa.gov)

**Chris Saint, Ph.D.**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Center for Environmental Research  
Ariel Rios Building (8723F)  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460  
Phone: 202-343-9716  
E-mail: [saint.chris@epa.gov](mailto:saint.chris@epa.gov)

**Douglas Young, Ph.D.**

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Risk Management Research  
Laboratory (443)  
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
Phone: 513-569-7624  
E-mail: [young.douglas@epa.gov](mailto:young.douglas@epa.gov)

**Contractor Support**

**Kristen LeBaron**

The Scientific Consulting Group, Inc.  
656 Quince Orchard Road, Suite 210  
Gaithersburg, MD 20878  
Phone: 301-670-4990  
E-mail: [klebaron@scgcorp.com](mailto:klebaron@scgcorp.com)



## **APPENDIX A: Teleconference Agenda**

### **TECHNOLOGY FOR SUSTAINABILITY RESEARCH SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING AGENDA**

**May 30, 2007**

**3:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time**

#### **CONFERENCE CALL**

#### **Participation by Teleconference Only**

Dial-in number: 866-299-3188

Follow prompt:

Conference Code is 5135697852#

3:00 p.m. – 3:15 p.m.	Welcome - Roll call - Overview of Progress	Dr. John Giesy Subcommittee Chair
3:15 p.m. – 3:20 p.m.	Administrative Procedures	Clois Slocum DFO
3:20 p.m. – 3:25 p.m.	Public Comment	
3:25 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.	Subcommittee Discussion - Summary of Draft Report Progress - Draft Report Discussion - Draft Report Next Steps and Schedule	Dr. John Giesy Subcommittee Chair
5:00 p.m.	Adjourn	